osgoode hall law journal

VOLUME 10
1972

Published by

OSGOODE HALL LAW SCHOOL OF YORK UNIVERSITY

Printed by

IMPERIAL PRESS LIMITED
548 KING STREET WEST.
TORONTO, ONTARIO

OSGOODE HALL LAW JOURNAL

BOARD OF EDITORS

PAUL EMOND, B.A., LL.B.

DOUGLAS LASH, B.A., LL.B.

BOB GARDINER, B.A., LL.B.

Secretary

SALLY LAYTON

Faculty Advisors

PAUL C. WEILER, B.A., M.A., LL.B., LL.M.

JACOB S. ZIEGEL, LL.B., LL.M., Ph.D.

Associate Editors

SIMON CHESTER

ARTHUR HALADNER

BLAKE MURRAY

ERIC SWITZER

Journal Staff

JENNIFER BANKIER

GREG BARNETT

MICHAEL HERMAN

RICK MCIVOR

DAVID ROUNTHWAITE

JAY SWARTZ

INDEX

TITLES OF LEADING ARTICLES

Page

AERONAUTICAL NOISE IN CANADA.
Hugh W. Silverman and *John D. Evans* 607

ATTRIBUTION OF INCOME
Maurice C. Cullity 93

CANADIAN TAXATION OF FOREIGN AFFILIATES.
Arthur R. A. Scace and *Douglas S. Ewens* 325

THE CASE FOR A GREATER FEDERAL ROLE IN THE ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION FIELD: AN EXAMINATION OF THE POLLUTION PROBLEM AND THE CONSTITUTION.
Paul Emond 647

THE COMMON LAW NUISANCE ACTIONS AND THE ENVIRONMENTAL BATTLE—WELL-TEMPERED SWORDS OR BROKEN REEDS.
John P. S. McLaren 505

"DISCRETION" IN THE ANALYSIS OF ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS.
H. T. Wilson 117

THE DRAMATIS PERSONAE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW
Albert Abel 61

ECONOMIC CONSIDERATIONS IN THE SELECTION OF POLLUTION CONTROL LEGISLATION.
Donald N. Dewees 627

EMMETT MATTHEW HALL: THE ACTIVIST AS JUSTICE.
Frederick Vaughan 411

THE JUDICIAL TREATMENT OF DISCLAIMER CLAUSES IN SALE OF GOODS TRANSACTIONS IN CANADA.
Peter A. Cumming 281

THE JURISDICTIONAL FACT DOCTRINE IN THE SUPREME COURT OF CANADA — A MITIGATING PLEA.
David Mullan 440

LAW REFORM AND THE JUDICIARY'S ROLE.
Emmett M. Hall 399

LEGISLATION TO ESTABLISH ECOLOGICAL RESERVES FOR THE PROTECTION OF NATURAL AREAS.
R. T. Franson 583

THE PRESUMPTION OF INNOCENCE AND THE CANADIAN BILL OF RIGHTS: REGINA V. APPLEBY.
Michael Mandel 450

PUBLIC NUISANCE AND STANDING TO SUE.
Wilfred Estey 563

QUANTITATIVE METHODS AND SUPREME COURT CASES.
Philip Slayton 429

STATISTICAL ANALYSIS OF [1970] S.C.R.
Jennifer K. Bankier 487

SUCCESSIVE CAUSES AND THE QUANTUM OF DAMAGES IN PERSONAL INJURY CASES.
Ulrich Wagner 369

TOWARDS AN INTEGRATED DISCLOSURE SYSTEM FOR ONTARIO SECURITIES LEGISLATION.
H. Garfield Emerson 1

AUTHORS OF LEADING ARTICLES

ABEL, Albert
The Dramatis Personae of Administrative Law 61

BANKIER, Jennifer K.
Statistical Analysis of [1970] S.C.R. 487

CULLITY, Maurice C.
Attribution of Income 93

CUMMING, Peter A.
The Judicial Treatment of Disclaimer Clauses in Sale of Goods Transactions in Canada 281

DEWEES, Donald N.
Economic Considerations in the Selection of Pollution Control Legislation 627

EMERSON, H. Garfield
Towards an Integrated Disclosure System for Ontario Securities Legislation 1

EMOND, Paul
The Case for a Greater Federal Role In the Environmental Protection Field: An Examination of the Pollution Problem and the Constitution 647

ESTEY, Wilfred
Public Nuisance and Standing to Sue 563

EVANS, John D.
Aeronautical Noise in Canada by Hugh W. Silverman and John D. Evans 607

EWENS, Douglas S.
Canadian Taxation of Foreign Affiliates by Arthur R. A. Scace and Douglas S. Ewens 325

FRANSON, R. T.
Legislation to Establish Ecological Reserves for the Protection of Natural Areas 583

HALL, Emmett M.
Law Reform and the Judiciary's Role 399

MANDEL, Michael
The Presumption of Innocence and the Canadian Bill of Rights: Regina v. Appleby 450

McLAREN, John P. S.
The Common Law Nuisance Actions and the Environmental Battle — Well-tempered Swords or Broken Reeds 505

MULLAN, David
The Jurisdictional Fact Doctrine in the Supreme Court of Canada — A Mitigating Plea 440

SCACE, Arthur R. A., and Ewens, Douglas S.
Canadian Taxation of Foreign Affiliates 325

SILVERMAN, Hugh W., and Evans, John D.
Aeronautical Noise in Canada 607

SLAYTON, Philip
Quantitative Methods and Supreme Court Cases 429

VAUGHAN, Frederick
Emmett Matthew Hall: The Activist as Justice 411

WAGNER, Ulrich
Successive Causes and the Quantum of Damages in Personal Injury Cases 369

WILSON, H. T.
"Discretion" in the Analysis of Administrative Process 117

NOTES AND COMMENTS

ATKEY, Ronald G.
The Statutory Powers Procedure Act, 1971 155

BAXTER, Ian F. G., and Johnston, David L.
Transfer of Investment Securities — Some Current Proposals 191

CARTER, Judge A. M.
Suggested Reforms in the Procedure in Small Claims Courts 215

CORRIGAN, Judge Michael
The Juvenile Court and Community Involvement 221

DRANOFF, Linda Silver
Women as Lawyers in Toronto 177

FISH, Susan A.
Administrative Discretion in Social Housing Policy 209

HONSBERGER, John
The Nature of Bankruptcy and Insolvency in a Constitutional Perspective 199

JOHNSTON, David L.
Transfer of Investment Securities — Some Current Proposals, By Ian F. G. Baxter and David L. Johnston 191

LITTLE, Judge William T.
The Need for Reform in the Juvenile Courts 225

SHAPIRO, Paul H.
"The Alberta Shift" — How to Avoid Ontario Succession Duties 229

WEILER, Paul C.
The Arbitrator, the Collective Agreement and the Law 141

BOOK REVIEWS
(Reviewer's name in brackets)

An International Review Symposium of

HOGARTH, John
Sentencing As A Human Process. Toronto:
University of Toronto Press, 1972
Introduction
(Simon Chester) 233
The Sentencing Behaviour of Ontario Judges: A Methodological Overview
(Glendon Schubert) 234
Implications for Judicial Policy
(Alfred P. Murrah) 257
The Criminal Process is a Legal Process
(Graham Parker) 260
Meaning and Ambiguity in Punishment (And Penology)
(John M. Finnis) 264
Sentencing and Criminal Justice
(Leslie T. Wilkins) 269
The Judicial Perspective
(Judge R. G. Groom) 272
A Reply
(John Hogarth) 276

LYON, Noel and Atkey, Ronald G. (Editors)
Canadian Constitutional Law In A Modern Perspective. Toronto:
University of Toronto Press, 1970.
(J. Ragnar Johnson) 497

MADDAUGH, Peter D.
A Bibliography of Canadian Legal History. Toronto:
York University Law Library, 1972.
(Margaret A. Banks) 501

ATKEY, Ronald G.
Canadian Constitutional Law In A Modern Perspective, By Noel Lyon and Ronald G. Atkey (Editors). Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1970.
(J. Ragnar Johnson) 497

CASES CITED

(Case comments in heavy print)

A

A.-G. v. Birmingham **548, 549**
A.-G. for British Columbia v. A.-G. for Canada 677
A.-G. for British Columbia v. A.-G. for Canada 662
A.-G. for Canada v. A.-G. for Ontario (Unemployment Insurance Case) 667
A.-G. for Canada v. A.-G. for Ontario (Fisheries Case) **677, 679**
A.-G. for Canada v. Nykorak 402
A.-G. for Ontario v. A.-G. for Canada 657
A.-G. (Ont.) v. A.-G. (Can.) (Voluntary Assignments Case) 206
A.-G. for Ontario v. Canada Temperance Federation 658
A.-G. for Ontario v. Israel Winner 672
A.-G. for Ontario v. Reciprocal Insurers 662
A.-G. for Ontario v. Toronto Junction Recreation Club 577
Advance Rumely Thresher Co. v. Armour 291
Advance Rumely Thresher Co. v. Lester 291
Alabastine Co., Paris Ltd. v. Canada Producer and Gas Engine Co. 290, 291
Allcock v. Manitoba Windmill and Pump Co. 288, 291
Anisminic v. Foreign Compensation Commission 442, 445, 449
Appleby v. Erie Tobacco Co. 554
Ares v. Venner 404, 424
Army and Navy Department Store Ltd. v. M.N.R. 101
Arrow Transfer Co. v. Fleetwood Logging Co. 293
Atlantic Aviation Ltd. v. Nova Scotia Light & Power Co. 623

B

Baily v. Derby Corporation 395
Baker v. Willoughby 384-86, 388, 390, 393, 395
Bell v. Ontario Human Rights Commission 440, 441, 443, 447-49
Binus v. The Queen 402
Board of Commerce Act, and the Combines and Fair Prices Act of 1919, In re 657, 661, 668
Bottom v. Ontario Leaf Tobacco 555, 556
Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka 423

C

Cahoon v. Franks 404
Cairns v. Canadian Refining Co. 516
Canada Foundry Co. v. Edmonton Portland Cement Co. 293, 299
Canada Paper Co. v. Brown 552, 553, 555, 558, 625
Canadian Bankers Association et al. v. A.-G. of Saskatchewan 205, 206
Canadian Building Materials Ltd. v. W. R. Meadows of Canada Ltd. 284, 290
Canadian Dominion Leasing Corporation v. Suburban Superdrug Ltd. 298
Canadian Fairbanks-Morse Co. v. Teightmeyer 288
Canadian Federation of Agriculture v. A.-G. for Quebec 663
Chadwick v. City of Toronto 554
Chandler Electric Co. v. Fuller 527
Citizens Insurance Co. of Canada v. Parsons 668
City of Toronto v. Bell Telephone Co. 672
Coggs v. Bernard 409

Cook v. Lewis 541
Co-operative Committee on Japanese Canadians v. A.-G. for Canada 658
Cork v. Greavette Boats Ltd. 290
Criminal Code, Reference Re Section 498A of the, ... 660
Cutler v. Vauxhall Motors Ltd. 378, 379

D
Dairy Industry Act, Reference as to the Validity of Section 5(a) of the, ... 663
Darowany v. The Queen 623
Davis v. United States 478, 479
Dillon v. Twin State Gas Electric Co. 380
Dingle v. Associated Newspapers Ltd. 385
Dominion News & Gifts (1962) Ltd. v. The Queen 500
Donoghue v. Stevenson 508
Douglas, Burt & Buchanan v. Texas Pacific Ry. Co. 396
Drummond Wren, re 498
Dulieu v. White 370
Duncan v. Szoldatits 448
Dunkelman v. M.N.R. 95-97, 109, 113

E
Esco v. Fort Henry Hotel Co. 526

F
Farm Products Marketing Act, Reference re 403, 670
Fasken Estate v. M.N.R. 97, 99, 100, 112
Filion v. New Brunswick International Paper Co. 513, 570, 571
Fillmore's Valley Nurseries Ltd. v. North American Cyanamid Ltd. 284
Fisher v. Zumwalt 517
Fleming v. Atkinson 402
Fort Frances Pulp and Power Co. v. Manitoba Free Press Co. 657
Freeman v. Consolidated Motors Ltd. 288

G
Gagnon v. Dominion Stamping 519
Gagnon v. The Queen 616
Gauthier v. Naneff 531, 553, 556
Godsoe v. Beatty 292
Goodyear Tire & Rubber Co. of Canada v. The Queen 664
Groat v. City of Edmonton 539, 552

H
Halsey v. Esso Petroleum 527
Harbutt's Plasticine Ltd. v. Wayne Tank and Pump Co. 303, 304, 306, 311, 312
Hart-Parr Co. v. Jones 292
Harwood v. Wyken Colliery Co. 390, 392-95
R. W. Heron Paving Ltd. v. Dilworth Equipment Ltd. 293
Hickey v. Electric Reduction Co. of Canada Ltd. 513, 570, 571, 573, 575
Hodge v. The Queen 499
Humphries v. Cousins 526, 527
Huston v. Lloyd Refineries 556

I

Imperial Gas, Light and Coke Co. v. Broadbent 549, 550, 552, 553
Industrial Relations & Disputes Investment Act, Reference re 659
Insurance Act of Canada, In re 665
International Chemical Workers Union, Local 161 v. Krever et al. 142

J

John Deere Plow Co. v. Wharton 669, 670
John Young & Co. v. Bankier Distillery Co. 538
Julius v. Bishop of Oxford 68

K

Karsales (Harrow) Ltd. v. Wallis 295, 297, 300, 302
Keelan et al. v. Norray Distributing Ltd. 315
Kent v. United States 221
Klippert v. The Queen 423
Knowles v. Anchorage Holdings Co. 297, 308

L

Lacroix v. The Queen 621, 623
Lagan Navigation Co. v. Lambeg Bleaching, Dyeing & Finishing Co. 581
Larson v. Boston Elevateed Ry. Co. 372
Lawson v. Interior Tree Fruit & Vegetable Committee of Direction 666
Leary v. United States 470, 471, 473, 474
Lee v. Showmen's Guild 69
Leeds Industrial Cooperative Society Ltd. v. Slack 553
Leland v. Oregon 477-79
Leschke v. Jeffs and Faulkner 382
Lightburn v. Belmont Sales Ltd. 298, 303
Loeb v. M.N.R. 105
Long v. Thiessen and Laliberte 385
Lord's Day Alliance of Canada v. A.-G. of British Columbia 661, 662
Love v. Port of London Authority 370

M

Manchester Corp. v. Farnworth 530
Markt & Co. v. Knight Steamship Co. 518
Marshall v. Ryan Motors Ltd. 290
Massey-Harris Co. v. Skelding 293
McCahill v. New York Transportation Co. 377
McKay v. The Queen 498
McKie v. The K.V.P. Co. 530, 537, 553, 556
R. G. McLean Ltd. v. Canadian Vickers Ltd. 299, 302
McNaughton 479
McNichol v. Dominion Motors Ltd. 291
McRae v. British Norwegian Whaling Co. 569, 571
Meade v. M.N.R. 97
Mendick v. The Queen 423
Metropolitan Life Insurance Co v. International Union of Operating Engineers, Local 796 449
Mitchell v. M.N.R. 100, 105
Mitchell v. O'Brien 448

Montreal v. Montreal Street Railway 673
Morris v. Redland Bricks Ltd. 551
Myers v. Director of Public Prosecutions 424

N

Naiberg v. M.N.R. 100
Natural Products Marketing Act, Reference re 670
Newhouse v. Coniagas Reduction Co. 540
No. 40 v. M.N.R. 110, 111
Noble and Wolf v. Alley et al. 498
Nova Mink Ltd. v. Trans-Canada Airlines 623

O

Ottawa Valley Power Co. v. Hydro Electric Power Commission 499
Owen v. Dix 370

P

Paul L. Gault, In the Matter of the Application of, ... 222, 226
Phillips v. The London and South Western Ry. Co. 394
Piché v. The Queen 404, 422
Pichosky v. M.N.R. 104, 105
Plessy v. Ferguson 423
Polemis and Furness, Wilhy and Co., In re 373
Portage La Prairie v. B.C. Pea Growers Ltd. 527
Preston v. Hilton 518, 519
Pronto Uranium Mines Ltd. v. Ontario Labour Relations Board 659
Proprietary Articles Trade Association v. A.-G. for Canada 660-62, 664

Q

Queddy River Driving Boom Co. v. Davidson 676

R

R. v. Appleby **450**, 456, 461, 463, 468, 469. 471, 473, 474
R. v. C.S.L. Ltd. 614
R. v. Cameron 499
R. v. Drybones 458, 465
R. v. Eastern Terminal Elevator Co. 668
R. v. George 402
R. v. Gonzales 423
R. v. Guertin 460
R. v. Hartley and McCallum (No. 1) 451, 452, 455
R. v. McCoole 451
R. v. McRae 451, 457
R. v. Patterson 456
R. v. Rice 613
R. v. Sharpe 473, 474
R. v. Silk 451, 452, 455, 457, 458, 460, 461
R. v. Ward 456, 457
R.C.A. Victor Ltd. v. I.W.A. 142
Ramsay v. Barnes 554
Rappaport v. Nichols and HubBar, Inc. 384
Reese v. M.N.R 101, 102
Reeves & Co. v. Chase 291
Roberts and Bagwell v. The Queen 625

Robins v. M.N.R. 103, 112
Robins v. National Trust Company 401
Roncarelli v. Duplessis 498
Rose v. Miles 573
Russell v. The Queen 656
Russell Transport Ltd. v. Ontario Malleable Iron Co. 543
Rylands v. Fletcher 507, 520, 523-28, 536, 537

S

SCM (U.K.) Ltd. v. W. J. Whittall & Son Ltd. 571, 573, 574
Sargent Hardware (1971) 150
Sawyer and Massey Co. v. Thibart 289
Sawyer and Massey Co. v. Thomas G. Ritchie 289
Schmidt v. International Harvester Co. of Canada 308
Schofield v. Emerson Brantingham Implement Co. 292-94
Shelfer v. City of London Electric Lighting Co. 548-55, 580
Sloan v. Empire Motors Ltd. and Vancouver Finance Co. 294
Smith v. Leech Brain & Co. 373-77, 397
Standard Sausage Co. v. Lee 663
Stene v. Evans 382, 384, 385
Stephens v. The Village of Richmond Hill 552
Steven Murray Truscott, In the Matter of a Reference re, ... 421, 422
Stockport Waterworks Co. v. Potter 530
Storgoff, In re 401
Stuart v. Bank of Montreal 401
Sturges v. Bridgman 533
Sturges v. Crowninshield 200
Suisse Atlantique Société D'Armement Maritime S.A. v. N.V. Rotterdamsche Kolen Centrale 295, 299-303, 306, 308, 316
Sura v. M.N.R. 102
Swindon Waterworks v. Wilts & Berks Canal Navigation Co. 539

T

Toronto Electric Commissioners v. Snider 661
Tot v. United States 473, 479
Tupper v. The Queen 451, 459

U

United States v. Gainey 474

V

Vaughan v. Taff Vale Railway Co. 545

W

Wallis, Son & Wells v. Pratt & Haynes 289, 290, 292
Warren v. Scruttons, Ltd. 374-76
Water and Water Powers, Reference re 676
Wertman v. M.N.R. 102, 106
Western Tractor Ltd. v. Dyck 299
Winship, In re 471, 474, 477, 479
Woods Manufacturing Co. v. The King 402
Woolmington v. The Director of Public Prosecutions 461-64, 467
Wright v. Masonite Corp. 523

SUBJECT MATTER INDEX

A

Acquiescence 544
Administrative Law 61, 117, 155, 209
Aeronautics Act 607
Aeronautical Noise 607
Airports Act 607
Arbitration 141
Attorney-General 567
Automobile Pollution Control 642

B

Bankruptcy 199
Bill 1
Bill of Rights, Canada 411, 450
Blumer, Herbert 117
B.N.A. Act 655
Boiler-Plate 281
Bonds 191
Brandeis Brief 399

C

Canada Criminal Code 260
Canals, Public Harbours, Rivers, and Lake Improvements (B.N.A.A.) 678
Capital Punishment 225
Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation 211
Civil Rights Statute Amendment Act 155
Class Actions 505, 575
Collective Agreements 141
Computers 191
Constitutional Law 199, 497, 647
Controlled Foreign Corporation 325
Criminal Law 260
Crown Corporation 61
Crown Liability Act 624

D

Damages 369
Death Penalty 225
Disclaimer Clauses 281
Disclosure 1
Discretionary Justice 117
Discrimination 177

E

Ecological Research 583
Ecological Reserves Act 583
Economics of Pollution 627, 648
Employment Standards Act 141
English Companies Act 1
Environment 505
Environmental Law 505

Environmental Problems 627
Environmental Protection 647
Estate Planning 229
Exculpatory Clauses 281

F
Federal Spending Power 667
Foreign Accrual Property Income 325
Foreign Affiliates 325
Fundamental Breach 281

H
Hall-Dennis Report 411
Hall, Emmett Matthew 411
Health Services 411
Housing - Public 209
Hogarth, John 233
Human Rights 440

I
Income 93
Income Tax 94
Income Tax Act (1972) 325
Income, Low 209
Indians 411
Inheritance and Succession 229
Insolvency 199
Internal Revenue Code 114
International Biological Programme 583
Investment Transfers 191

J
Judgements 233, 269
Judicial Review Procedure Act 155
Judicial Statistics 487
Jurisdictional Fact Doctrine 440
Juvenile Courts 215, 225
Juvenile Delinquents Act 225

K
Kimber Report 1

L
Labour Relations Act 141
Land Trusts 583
Land Use 583
Law Reform 399
Law Schools 411
Lawyers 177
Legal Aid 225
Legal History, Canadian 501
Limited Liability Clauses 281

M

Maternity 177
Medicare 411
Merger Report 1
Metis 411
Military Law 69
Ministry of Transport 607
Multiple Causation 369

N

National Parks 583
Native People 411
Navigation and Shipping (B.N.A. Act) 675
New York Stock Exchange 191
Noise Pollution 607
Nuisance 505, 563

O

O.H.S.I.P. Act 144
Ombudsman 61
Ontario Human Rights Code 440
Ontario Securities Commission 1
Ontario Succession Duty Act 229

P

Passive Income 325
Past Nuisance 505
Peace, Order and Good Government (B.N.A. Act) 656
Penology 225, 264
Perceived Noise Level Scale 607
Personal Injury Cases 369
Polish Law 102
Pollution 607, 647
Pollution Abatement 505
Pollution Control Legislation 627
Prescription 543
Presumption of Innocence 450
Protection of Natural Areas 583
Public Administration 61
Public Health 663
Public Inquiries Act 155

Q

Quantitative Methods 429

R

Reasonable Doubt 450
Recidivism 215, 269
Regression Analysis 237
Relative Neighbourhood Equation 533
Riparian Rights 537

S

Sale of Goods 281
Scalogram Analysis 429
Sea Coast and Inland Fisheries (B.N.A. Act) 676
Securities 1
Securities Act 1933 1
Securities Exchange Act 1934 1
Semantics 269
Sentencing 233, 257, 260, 269, 272
Small Claims 215
Stare Decisis 399
Specialization 177
Statistics 233, 429, 489
Statutory Powers Procedure Act 1971 155
Stocks 1, 191
Successive Causes 369
Succession Duties 229
Supreme Court 399
Supreme Court of Canada 429, 440, 489

T

Taxation 93, 325, 665
Thin-Skull 369
Thompson, Victor 117
Toronto 177
Trade and Commerce Power (B.N.A. Act) 668
Training Schools 225
Truscott Case 411
Truscott, Steven Murray 411
Trusts 97

U

Underwriters 1
Unions 61

W

Weber, Max 117
Wheat Report 1
Witholding Tax 325
Women 177
Workmen's Compensation Act 369
Works and Undertakings (B.N.A. Act) 672

Z

Zoning Laws 535